Version of Record: https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0140196318303744 Manuscript\_58aeb06d66e6f54cd57f8ecc22dc4a2a

- 1 Contrasted seasonal balances in a Sahelian pastoral ecosystem result in a neutral annual
- 2 carbon balance
- 3
- 4 Mohamed Habibou Assouma<sup>1,2,3\*</sup>, Pierre Hiernaux<sup>4</sup>, Philippe Lecomte<sup>1,2,3</sup>, Alexandre
- 5 Ickowicz<sup>2,5</sup>, Martial Bernoux<sup>6</sup>, Jonathan Vayssières<sup>1,2,3</sup>
- 6
- <sup>7</sup> <sup>1</sup> CIRAD, Umr SELMET, Dakar, Senegal
- 8 <sup>2</sup> SELMET, Univ Montpellier, CIRAD, INRA, Montpellier SupAgro, Montpellier, France
- 9 <sup>3</sup> PPZS, Pastoral Systems and Dry Lands, Dakar, Senegal
- <sup>4</sup> Pastoc, Pastoralisme Conseil, Caylus, France
- <sup>5</sup> CIRAD, Umr SELMET, Montpellier, France
- <sup>6</sup> IRD, Umr Eco&Sols F-34060, Montpellier, France

13

- 14 **\*Corresponding author**: Mohamed Habibou Assouma. Email:
- 15 habibou.assouma@gmail.com
- 16 **Present address**: Dp PPZS, ISRA-LNERV, BP 2057 Dakar Hann, Senegal

17

### 18 Abstract

19 This paper explores an original approach in which greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions and 20 carbon (C) accumulation are assessed monthly and at landscape scale to account for the 21 highly seasonal monsoon climate and the mobility of pastoral herds that characterize West 22 African pastoral ecosystems.

- 23 The study was conducted in northern Senegal, in the service area of the Widou Thiengoly
- borehole, a circular zone of 706 km<sup>2</sup> centered on the borehole. The C balance was calculated

using an ecosystem approach, i.e. taking all main sources of GHG emissions and C sinks of
the ecosystem, not only anthropogenic sources, into account.

The annual C balance of the pastoral ecosystem was  $-0.04\pm0.01$  tC-eq.ha<sup>-1</sup>.year<sup>-1</sup>, showing that total GHG emissions were mitigated by C accumulation in trees, soil and livestock. The C balance varied considerably with the seasons, with a positive monthly balance in the wet season, from July to October (+0.58 tC-eq.ha<sup>-1</sup>.month<sup>-1</sup>) and a negative monthly balance in the cold dry season from November to February and the hot dry season from March to June (-0.57 and -0.05 tC-eq.ha<sup>-1</sup>.month<sup>-1</sup> respectively).

Care should be taken when generalizing these results, which were obtained in a dry year,because of strong inter-annual variations in rainfall.

35

Keywords: Ecosystem functioning, GHG emissions, C sequestration, Landscape, Senegal
 37

# 38 **1. Introduction**

The contribution of the world's livestock sector to global anthropogenic greenhouse gas 39 (GHG) emissions is estimated to be 14.5% (Gerber et al., 2013). The environmental impact of 40 41 intensive versus extensive livestock systems is a matter of debate in the scientific community. In sub-Saharan Africa, extensive pastoral systems are assumed to be responsible for the 42 highest rates of GHG emissions per unit of animal product despite their modest contribution 43 to global GHG emissions (Gerber et al., 2013). The main reasons are the low productivity of 44 the herds and the high methanogenic potential of forage ingested by grazing livestock 45 46 especially during the long dry season. Pastoral rangelands account for more than 25% of terrestrial ecosystems and about 40% of Africa's land area, where semi-arid rangelands 47 dominate (Herrero et al., 2016; Tagesson et al., 2015a). The semi-arid tropics in western and 48 49 central Africa are characterized by contrasted seasonal conditions with rainfall limited to a

short summer season, resulting in highly seasonal forage availability and quality. In response, 50 51 pastoralism, the dominant economic activity, is based on seasonal livestock mobility (Turner et al., 2014). Rainfall drives rangeland ecosystem functioning (i) by stimulating the growth of 52 herbaceous vegetation providing highly digestible green forage that insures the annual growth 53 and the reproduction of grazing animals (Chirat et al., 2014), and (ii) by activating the soil 54 biological activity responsible for the decomposition and mineralization of organic matter, 55 and hence the recycling of N, P and other nutrients (Delon et al., 2015). N and P availability 56 to plants is the main factor that limits ecosystem production (Penning de Vries and Djiteye, 57 1982). Consequently, rangeland production is particularly vulnerable to seasonal variations in 58 59 rainfall amounts and distribution patterns (Nassef et al., 2009).

Pastoralism is an extensive livestock production system with sophisticated herd management 60 based on selective grazing of communal rangelands. Herd management is particularly difficult 61 62 in the dry season when drinking water and forage availability and quality are limited (McGahey et al., 2014). In pastoral ecosystems, livestock, mostly ruminants, play a major role 63 64 in speeding up C, N, P and K recycling. Livestock digest grazed fodder largely composed of cellulose that would otherwise degrade slowly (Petersen et al., 2013). The nondigested 65 fraction is excreted as N rich urine and feces that represent a source of rich and easily 66 degradable organic material for meso-fauna and micro-organisms to mineralize, providing the 67 soil with nutrients, especially the limiting N and P, as well as stable soil organic C, which 68 enhances soil biochemical fertility (Whitmore, 2001). The C and N cycles both strongly 69 influence GHG emissions and C sequestration (Soussana et al., 2004). It is thus likely that the 70 71 strong seasonality of rainfall distribution and of the resulting grazing resource are responsible for the marked seasonal variations in GHG emissions and C sequestration. 72

The aim of this study was to produce a dynamic seasonal representation of the C balance byassessing key stocks and fluxes of the C and N cycles in a Sahel pastoral ecosystem on a

monthly basis, whereas the C balances of agricultural systems are usually assessed on an 75 76 annual basis and seasonal variations are not taken into account. In the present study, stocks and fluxes were assessed through monthly in situ observations and measurements made over a 77 full year in a single territory, the Widou Thiengoly borehole service area (WTSA). The 78 WTSA is located in the Ferlo, a Sahelian pastoral region in northern Senegal. The sampling 79 strategy was also designed to account for landscape heterogeneity. Such field data are new in 80 the Sahel. This explains why the literature on the C balance of pastoral systems in sub-81 Saharan Africa is poor. What is more, most of the C balances available for tropical agro-82 ecosystems use default emission factors provided by IPCC (see for instance Doran-Browne et 83 84 al. (2016)), with large uncertainties on these default emission factors due to the lack of *in situ* measurements in tropical systems (Rosenstock et al., 2013). Most in situ observation-based C 85 balances of African ecosystems use data provided by the regional network of flux towers 86 87 (Valentini et al., 2014). These studies are based on temporally intense but spatially limited measurements that do not account for the marked spatial heterogeneity of GHG emissions 88 89 induced by livestock mobility (Assouma et al., 2017). Another originality of this study is the nature of GHG sources taken into account in the assessment. The C balance in agriculture is 90 usually calculated using two different approaches, life cycle analysis (LCA) and GHG 91 inventories, both of which only consider anthropogenic sources of GHG emissions. LCA is 92 used to assess the environmental impact of a product by calculating all the GHG emissions 93 that occur throughout the life cycle of a product, and the assessment is made at the supply 94 chain level (Gerber et al., 2013). GHG inventories are used to assess the environmental 95 impact of human activities within a system and are performed at the country, territory or farm 96 level (Rakotovao et al., 2017). In this study, we designed an original approach, called the 97 "ecosystem C balance", that accounts for all the main sources of GHG emissions and C 98 accumulation in the ecosystem, not only anthropogenic sources. We developed this approach 99

because some studies demonstrated the ability of permanent grasslands under temperate 100 101 (Soussana et al., 2010) or tropical conditions (Doran-Browne et al., 2016) to mitigate anthropogenic GHG emissions and we wanted to go further by taking into account all main 102 103 sources of GHG emissions and C sinks of the ecosystem, to find out if the ecosystem is in equilibrium or not. The ecosystem approach is particularly suitable when pastoral ecosystems 104 are extensive, low-input-systems, mainly based on natural resources, close to natural 105 ecosystems. The ecosystem C balance makes it possible to assimilate the complexity of the 106 107 ecosystem and to understand the interactions between the components of the ecosystem (animal-soil-vegetation and atmosphere) to explain the C balance and its seasonal and 108 between-year dynamics. 109

110

111

#### 2. Material and methods

112

# 113 **2.1** The Sahelian pastoral system at Widou Thiengoly

The Ferlo region (70,000 km<sup>2</sup>) is located between latitudes 15° and 16° 30' N and longitudes 114 13°30' and 16° W and includes a large fraction of the Senegalese pastoral zone. The climate 115 116 of the region is semi-arid monsoon of Sahelian type characterized by the alternation of two seasons: a 4-month wet season (July to October) and an 8-month dry season (November to 117 June). The dry season is subdivided into two 4-month seasons, the first being the cold dry 118 119 season from November to February and the second being the hot dry season from March to June. The main economy of families in the Ferlo region is pastoral husbandry, characterized 120 by shared access to communal grazing lands, grazing resources (herbaceous plants plus 121 122 browsing the foliage, twigs and fruits of woody plants) and drinking water resources. Prior to the 1950s, the Ferlo was only grazed during the rainy and early dry seasons by Fulani 123 transhumance herders. In the dry season, due to lack of accessible water, the pastoralists had 124

to move either northwards to the floodplain rangelands of the Senegal River valley or 125 126 southwards to the Sérère croplands or the sub-humid savannas located further south and east. From the 1950s onwards, deep boreholes with mechanical pumps to tap the Maestrichian 127 water table were drilled at regular intervals every 20 to 30 km. Since then, transhumant 128 pastoralists have settled in the Ferlo, in family camps often set up in the vicinity of temporary 129 ponds but nevertheless scattered throughout the service area of the boreholes. Our case study 130 was the service area (WTSA) of the Widou Thiengoly borehole (15° 59' N, 15° 19' W), a 131 circular territory centered on the borehole with a radius of usually 15 km, i.e. half the mean 132 distance between neighboring boreholes. The WTSA extends over 706 km<sup>2</sup>, hosts 354 133 134 pastoral camps and a population of 4,800 inhabitants. The total livestock population of the WTSA ranged from 15 274 to 33 095 TLU in August and December, respectively. The 135 average livestock population was composed of cattle (54% of total TLU), sheep (27%), goats 136 137 (8%), horses (3%) and donkeys (8%). The WTSA was subdivided into six landscape units based on land use, the type of vegetation and soils (Assouma et al., 2017). Landsat image TM 138 139 204-049 dated November 3, 2010 and field observations (GPS points to mark the boundaries of the units and identify particular points) were used to map the six landscape units: 140

- Grazing lands (635.45 km<sup>2</sup>, 89.9% of the WTSA area), sparsely wooded savannas,

Settlements (44.46 km², 6.3%), the 354 settlements include the pastoralists dwellings,
night corrals and the day resting spots for their livestock,

Forest plantations (6.23 km², 0.9%), include the five most recent forest plantations
 established since 2005 by the Senegalese government as part of the Great Green Wall
 project. These forest are fenced and are only accessible to livestock three years after
 planting,

Natural ponds (19.34 km², 2.7%), 67 ponds located in the low-lying areas of interdune depressions that harbor a string of shallow ponds during the wet season and are

the main sources of water for the herds in the wet season and in the early months ofthe dry season,

The borehole (0.78 km², or 0.1%) is the only source that can be used water the herds
when the ponds have dried up, and is visited once a day or every two days by most
animals (some small ruminants are watered in the camp with water in tanks
transported by donkey carts from the borehole) and pastoralist families for at least six
months of the year,

Enclosures (0.24 km<sup>2</sup>, 0.03%), six small fenced experimental plots that were set up as
 part of a formal research project in 1981, to assess the long term effect of conservation
 without grazing or burning.

160

161

### 2.2 Conceptual model and the components of the C balance

162 The main C and N stocks and flows between stocks in the pastoral ecosystem and GHG fluxes
163 to the atmosphere (CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub>, N<sub>2</sub>O) were used in the conceptual model (Figure 2).

164 The conceptual model was designed using data in the literature to identify GHG emissions and the sources and sinks of C that have to be taken into account in the C balance. According 165 to Gerber et al. (2013), extensive livestock systems in sub-Sahara Africa are responsible for 166 high rates of CH<sub>4</sub> emissions due to enteric fermentation. Termites are one of the main natural 167 sources of CH<sub>4</sub> in tropical savannas through the digestion of cellulose by the micro-organisms 168 living in their guts (Jamali et al., 2011). The deposition of livestock excreta on rangeland soils 169 increases N<sub>2</sub>O emissions from the soil (Pelster et al., 2016). In the Sahelian pastoral 170 ecosystem, Assouma et al. (2017) also pointed to CH<sub>4</sub> emissions from standing water in ponds 171 172 and in the vicinity of the borehole due to organic matter directly excreted by livestock during watering or resting and drained by runoff from the vicinity. Bush fires are also known to be a 173 source of GHG emissions in pastoral ecosystems, especially in tropical and subtropical Africa 174

(Devineau et al., 2010). The main C sinks usually considered in the C balance of agro-175 176 ecosystems are vegetation and soils (Soussana et al., 2004). However, the herbaceous mass is not considered as a C sink because the herbaceous vegetation of Sahelian rangelands only 177 comprises annuals (Hiernaux and Le Houerou, 2006), the herbage is thus transient and does 178 not insure long term accumulation of C. Only woody plants contribute to year to year C 179 accumulation in wood and roots. The leaves, flowers, fruits, part of twigs and branches and 180 roots of woody plants are transient, like those of herbaceous plants, and are not considered as 181 C sinks. However, all these transient vegetation components, and the excrement deposited by 182 the grazing livestock contribute to the building up of soil organic matter, an important C sink 183 184 under tropical grasslands (Doran-Browne et al., 2016).

A third sink in a pastoral ecosystem are the bodies of the animals. Indeed a pastoral system in sub-Sahara Africa is based on a core herd of reproductive adults that have strong cultural and socio-economic functions (Turner et al., 2014). This dimension of social capital accumulation is consistent with considering the herd as a C sink in the ecological approach use in the present study.

190

191

#### 2.2 Measurement and estimation of GHG fluxes

192

193

#### 2.2.1 Enteric methane

The monthly feed intakes and their dietary digestibility for cattle, sheep and goats were predicted using fecal near infrared spectroscopy (NIRS) (Assouma et al., 2018). The feces excreted were collected in fecal bags fitted on the animals and were randomly but systematically sampled along the livestock grazing paths. The predicted monthly intake and digestibility were then used to estimate the methane enteric emissions. The derived methane emissions (ME in gCH<sub>4</sub>/kg BW) were estimated using the general equation adapted for tropical conditions developed by Archimède et al. (2011):

201	$ME = 0.082 + 0.028 \times DOMI$
202	where DOMI is total digestible organic matter intake (in g/kg BW), which was calculated as
203	follows:
204	DOMI = MSvi x 89% OM x OMd
205	Default emission factors were used for non-ruminants (horses and donkeys) (IPCC, 2006).
206	
207	2.2.2 Soil and surface water emissions
208	The method used to measure GHG emissions from soil and surface water is described in full
209	in (Assouma et al., 2017). The static chamber method (40*20*20 cm) was used for GHG
210	emissions from soils. Two chambers were set up in each measuring site to obtain replicates
211	and to insure the measurements were representative. For each flux measurement, the gas was
212	sampled at 30 min intervals, i.e. at T <sub>0</sub> , T <sub>30</sub> , T <sub>60</sub> and T <sub>90</sub> . For GHG emissions, samples of water
213	were taken from both natural ponds and ponds in the vicinity of the borehole and immediately
214	sterilized with mercury chloride (0.01 ml/vial) to halt biological activity. To measure
215	emissions from both soil and surface water, the air samples were analyzed using a SRI 8610C
216	Gas Chromatograph.
217	
218	2.2.3 Other sources of GHG emissions
219	As other sources of GHG emissions are considerably smaller, they were not measured on-
220	field, but estimated using emission factors in the literature.
221	Enteric methane emissions by termites were estimated from coefficients per unit area adjusted
222	to the density of termite mounds in a tropical semi-arid context (Traoré et al., 2008).
223	Emissions in the wet and dry seasons were distinguished (Jamali et al., 2013).
224	To estimate emissions due to the fuel consumed by the motor pump, the quantity of diesel oil
225	consumed each month was obtained from the Borehole Management Committee, which keeps

226	a management logbook. The quantity consumed was then converted into the quantity of CO <sub>2</sub>
227	emitted monthly using the emission factor proposed by (IPCC, 2006).
228	Due to low rainfall in our study year, standing herbaceous biomass was limited, and according
229	to data provided by the local fire management service and in situ observations, no bush fires
230	occurred in the WTSA during the study period.
231	
232	2.3 Estimation of C accumulation in animals, plants and soil
233	
234	2.3.1 Variations in the C stock in livestock
235	Variations in the C stock in animals were estimated by keeping track of changes in the
236	livestock population through surveys of the herd and monitoring of 40 sampled herds (i.e.
237	11.3% of the WTSA herds), which provided information on the changes in the composition of
238	the herd according to species, gender and age classes. Herds were monitored to quantify
239	incoming fluxes (purchases, births, loans and returns from transhumance) and outgoing fluxes
240	(deaths, sales, gifts, loans and transhumance departures). In addition, monthly variations in
241	animal live weight were estimated from barometric measurements in three selected herds
242	(Njoya et al., 1997).
243	
244	2.3.2 Variations in C stock in wood
245	
246	- Inventory of woody plants and of their mass in the WTSA
247	The "point-centered quarter" (PCQ) described by Clark and Evans (1954), was used to assess
248	the density of trees (height > 4 m) and of shrubs (height < 4 m) at each site. At 50-m intervals
249	along a 500 m transect, the distance to the nearest tree and shrubs was measured in each of the

four quarters delineated by the transect line and the perpendicular at that point. The mean density (D) of the number of trees and shrubs per ha and the standard error of that mean were calculated using Pollard's algorithm (Pollard (1971), from the sums of squares of the distances measured for the four individuals of the n measuring points using the following formula:

255

# **D** =(10<sup>4</sup>)\* 4 \* (4\*n-1)/( $\pi$ \* $\Sigma$ dist<sup>2</sup>)

Leaf mass (Mleaf) was estimated using a specific allometric function that calculates the leaf mass from the circumference of each trunk (Cir, m). The following power type function was used:

259

# Mleaf = oo \* Cir<sup>ex</sup>

260 The oo and ex coefficients were taken from the overview by Henry et al. (2011) for each261 species.

Like leaf mass, wood volume was calculated using another power type function of the circumference and the wood mass was derived from the wood volume by multiplying it by specific wood volume densities for each species. The total mass of woody plants at a given site was then obtained by multiplying the leaf and wood mass by the tree and shrub densities.

266

#### 267 - Estimation of annual growth of wood mass

The annual increment in wood mass was calculated from the mean annual increment of the stem circumference estimated from dendrometric measurements carried out in June 2009 and June 2015, i.e. after an interval of six years. Wood production during the six year period was estimated for each tree measured by the difference in wood mass in 2009 and in 2015, both assessed using the allometric equations proposed by Henry et al. (2011) as a function of the stem circumference. Annual wood production in WTSA was obtained by multiplying the mean annual wood production of the 24 woody plant species by the tree density of the different species observed in the WTSA as a whole. Root mass was estimated as a fraction
(38%) of aboveground wood mass, as proposed by Woomer et al. (2004). This coefficient was
used to estimate annual root production.

278

279

### 2.3.3 Soil C accumulation

- 280
- 281 Variations in C stored in the soil

The soil compartment was considered as a "black box" in which the different processes 282 (mineralization, priming effect, etc.) driving soil organic matter dynamics were not 283 represented and the different forms of C stocks in the soil, more or less stable, were also not 284 distinguished. The accumulation of C in the soil was calculated as the difference between C 285 inputs and C outputs on a monthly basis using the C fluxes described in figure 3. C inputs are 286 287 organic matter deposited on the soil in the form of livestock excreta, litter from trees, shrubs and herbaceous plants. Root turnover and rhizodeposition are two other sources of C inputs, 288 both of similar magnitude (Jones et al., 2009), that were taken into account in the calculation 289 290 of soil C accumulation. C outputs are CO<sub>2</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub> emissions from the soil to the atmosphere. Losses due to runoff and leaching are limited under these limited rainfall conditions (Kindler 291 et al., 2011). They were not taken into account in this study. 292

293

294 - *C* inputs

Fecal deposition on the soil was assessed based on the daily fodder intake by animal multiplied by the diet digestibility and by the number of animals of each species present in the WTSA (Assouma et al., 2018).

The quantity of herbaceous litter buried in the soil was estimated by the difference between the total herbaceous aboveground mass in the previous month and the sum of the 300 aboveground herbaceous mass and the herbaceous mass ingested that month using the301 following formula:

# 302 Buried mass m= aboveground mass m-1 – (aboveground massm+ ingested massm) 303 where m is the month considered and m-1 is the preceding month.

The litter buried during the late wet season, i.e. in August and September, was disregarded as 304 the rate of senescence is less than 10% during the growth of annual herbaceous plants. To 305 account for the spatial heterogeneity of the herbaceous mass at each site, the herbaceous layer 306 307 was divided into four strata based on the apparent bulk of the herbaceous layer: zero in bare soil patches, low, medium or high in vegetated patches (Dardel et al., 2014). The frequency of 308 309 each stratum was assessed visually and the herbaceous layer was classified at one meter intervals along a one-meter-wide strip along a 500 m long transect (Hiernaux et al., 2009). 310 Total and green vegetation cover (visually estimated as % cover), standing and litter mass 311 312 (destructive cutting, with harvest, air drying and weighing) were assessed in three  $1 \times 1$  m plots randomly sampled in each stratum along the transects. The total aboveground 313 314 herbaceous mass of the site was then computed by weighting the mean mass per stratum by 315 the frequency of the stratum along the 500 m transect. The herbaceous root mass was assessed using a tube 7 cm in diameter inserted to a depth of 30 cm in the soil of each quadrat. All the 316 excavated soil was sieved to 2 mm to remove the roots. Subsamples of straw, litter and roots 317 were dried in an oven at 65 °C for 72 hours and then weighed again to determine the dry 318 319 matter content.

The root turnover of the herbaceous plants was estimated at 53% of net root production (Gill and Jackson, 2000). The same coefficient was used to estimate rhizodeposition (Jones et al., 2009). Both processes only occur when the roots are alive, i.e. during the wet season in herbaceous plants. During the dry season, a constant rate of decomposition was applied to the herbaceous root mass that remained at the end of the wet season.

13

Woody plants recycle leaves, a fraction of the branches that fall and roots through turnover. All the leaves produced in one year were assumed to be recycled over the course of a complete year whatever the phenological regime among the six types identified (Hiernaux et al., 1994). For each phenological type, the breakdown of the leaves over the 12 months was set at a monthly time step based on the monthly coefficients in Hiernaux et al. (1999).

The mass of the branches returned to the soil was assessed at 5.4% of annual wood mass production (Marion et al., 2015). The woody plant root turnover and rhizodeposition were estimated as a fraction (56% for both C flows) of the annual increment of the root mass, i.e. net root production (Gill and Jackson, 2000).

334

335 - *C* ouputs

 $CO_2$  and  $CH_4$  gas emissions were measured at each site using static gas chambers as described in section 2.3.2. The measured gas fluxes were converted into C equivalent using the molar mass of each element.

339

340

#### 2.4 C balance calculated at three temporal scales: month, season and year

#### 341

#### balance carculated at three temporal searcs. month, season and year

# 2.4.1 Sampling strategy designed to account for seasonal dynamics

In order to establish the C balance of the ecosystem over a full year, all the observations and 342 measurements were made in the WTSA, except for C accumulation in trees and shrubs which 343 was assessed in an additional study site where historical data were available. The additional 344 Ferlo site is located near the village of Dier Biran (15°21'N, 15°28'W) close to Dahra (Figure 345 1). All observations and measurements in the WTSA were repeated at 13 sites selected to 346 account for the spatial heterogeneity of the WTSA landscape (five sites in the grazing lands, 347 two sites in the vicinity of the borehole, settlements and ponds and one site in enclosures and 348 forest plantations). Two more sites, one in an enclosure and one in a forest plantation in the 349 WTSA were added to the 13 sites for a survey of vegetation including grass, trees and shrubs. 350

Observations and measurements were made between July 2014 and June 2015 (table 1). Table 1 lists the frequency and the number of on-field observations and measurements made per flux and stock type. The sources of GHG emissions (enteric CH<sub>4</sub>, fuel combustion, bush fires) were assessed monthly except for GHG fluxes from soil and surface water, which were measured once a month in the wet season (July to October 2014), once in the cold dry season (January 2015) and once in the hot dry season (May 2015).

To measure C accumulation in livestock, a monthly demographic survey was conducted of 40 357 herds (i.e. 11.3% of the WTSA herds) and a monthly survey of animal weight in three herds 358 (one small, one medium and one large). C accumulation in trees and shrubs was measured 359 360 through tree inventories taken at the 15 sites in the WTSA and dendometric measurements taken at an interval of six years (one in June 2009 and one in June 2015) on 24 marked geo-361 referenced trees. Concerning C accumulation in soils, C input and output flows were 362 estimated monthly (deposition of feces, deposition of litter from herbaceous vegetation during 363 the wet season) or once every two months (deposition of litter from herbaceous vegetation 364 365 during the dry season), except for deposition of litter from trees and shrubs, which was estimated annually and then interpolated per month (section 2.4.2). 366

367

368

#### 2.4.2 Distribution of C accumulation and GHG emissions per month

The different components of the C balance (GHG fluxes and variations in C stocks) were distributed monthly to establish the monthly C balances. The components established from data monitored monthly (emissions of enteric methane, emissions from the motor pump and C accumulation in livestock, see section 2.4.1 for sampling strategy) did not require interpolation, whereas components established from data monitored on a bimonthly, seasonal or annual basis (soil and water GHG emissions, enteric methane from termites and C accumulation in soil and woody plants) did require interpolation. For soil and water GHG emissions, the measurements made in January were considered to be representative of emissions during the cold-dry season, and those made in May, of the hot-dry season.

For CH<sub>4</sub> emissions from termites, the seasonal emission factors were considered to be thesame in each month of each season.

For C accumulation in woody plants, the annual production of aboveground and belowground
wood biomass was distributed over the 12 months as a proportion of the monthly production
of foliage by each woody species to obtain a monthly estimation of C accumulation in wood.

For C accumulation in soil, the annual root turnover and rhizodeposition of woody plants was also distributed monthly according to the production of leaf mass. There was no reason to distribute the estimated annual fall of dead branches as a function of leaf mass and, given the lack of field observations, a simple uniform distribution over the 12 months of the year was made.

389

390

#### 2.4.3 Carbon balance per month, season and over the year

To establish the C balance of the ecosystem as a whole, the emissions were accounted for 391 392 positively (return of GHG to atmosphere) and the C stock variations were accounted for negatively (capture of CO<sub>2</sub> from the atmosphere). All the emissions of the three GHG were 393 converted into eq-CO<sub>2</sub> using the global warming potentials proposed by the IPCC (2013), 394 which are 1, 34 and 296 for CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O respectively. The variations in mass in animal 395 bodies, and plants were converted into C accumulation (expressed as C equivalent) using the 396 conversion factors listed in Assouma (2016), and then converted into CO<sub>2</sub> equivalent to 397 398 establish the C balance. The conversion factor from C equivalent to CO<sub>2</sub> equivalent is 3.67. The balance, the sum of emissions and the sum of variations in C stocks are expressed in CO<sub>2</sub> 399 equivalent per unit area to facilitate comparison with other types of ecosystems. For the 400

description of the variability of the C balance over time, GHG emissions and variations in C
stock were detailed over the 12 months, and then aggregated over the three seasons described
in section 2.1 (wet season, cold dry season and hot dry season) and over the whole year.

404

405 **3. Results** 

406

# 407 **3.1 GHG emissions at the pastoral ecosystem level**

Most of the GHG emissions occurred during the wet season and, in July and October, were 408 higher than the annual average (figure 4). Emissions were lower than annual average 409 throughout the dry season, however in the cold dry season, emissions were a little higher than 410 in the hot dry season. The relative contribution of most of the pools varied over the year, with 411 a major contribution to the variation of (i) N<sub>2</sub>O emissions from soil related to the deposition 412 of animal excreta on the ground  $(24.6.10^{-2}, 5.4.10^{-2} \text{ and } 7.9.10^{-2} \text{ tCO}_2\text{-eq.ha}^{-1}\text{.Month}^{-1}$  in the 413 wet season, cold dry season, and hot dry season, respectively) and (ii) enteric CH<sub>4</sub> emissions 414 from ruminants  $(3.8.10^{-2}, 3.5.10^{-2} \text{ and } 3.4.10^{-2} \text{ tCO}_2\text{-eq.ha}^{-1}\text{.Month}^{-1}$  in the wet season, cold 415 dry season, and hot dry season, respectively). CH<sub>4</sub> emissions from surface water and from wet 416 soil were particularly dependent on the season (4.4.10<sup>-2</sup>, 0.6.10<sup>-2</sup> and 0.3.10<sup>-2</sup> tCO<sub>2</sub>-eq.ha<sup>-</sup> 417 <sup>1</sup>.Month<sup>-1</sup> during the wet season, cold dry season and hot dry season, respectively). 418

The relative contribution of the different GHG sources to annual GHG emissions from the ecosystem (figure 5) ranked nitrous oxide (N<sub>2</sub>O) first (59% of total emissions), methane CH<sub>4</sub> second (41%) and carbon dioxide CO<sub>2</sub> third (<1%). The three main GHG fluxes were emissions from the soil mainly due to the deposition of animal excreta on the ground (66%), emissions from the ponds (20%) and enteric methane from ruminants (11%). Enteric fermentation from termite mounds was responsible for 3% of total GHG emissions.

425

## 426 **3.2** Carbon accumulation in trees, soil and livestock at the pastoral ecosystem level

Monthly variations in the C stock in each pool and at the scale of the whole pastoral 427 ecosystem (figure 6) remained relatively stable in the hot dry season, varied in the cold dry 428 season and were even more variable in the wet season. Most C accumulation in the soil 429 occurred during the dry season, particularly in the cold dry season. However, most C 430 accumulated in the wood and in the roots of trees and shrubs in the wet season. Over the full 431 year and at ecosystem scale, the soil behaved as a C sink. Variations in C stocks were 432 negative in the wet season because of high soil GHG emissions. Conversely, the cold and hot 433 dry seasons were periods of C accumulation in the soil. These results highlight the seasonal 434 variations in C stocks, the wet season being characterized by the concomitant GHG release 435 from soil and C accumulation in plants. 436

C mainly accumulated in woody plants and soil in the pastoral ecosystem, and accounted for
69% and 31% of the area's annual C sequestration potential, respectively (Figure 7).
Livestock only contributed about 1% of total C accumulation. Overall, the ecosystem
sequestrated 0.75 tc ha<sup>-1</sup>.year<sup>-1</sup> distributed as follows: 0.52 tC.ha<sup>-1</sup>.year<sup>-1</sup> in trees, 0.23 tC.ha<sup>-1</sup>.year<sup>-1</sup> in the soil and 0.007 tC.ha<sup>-1</sup>.year<sup>-1</sup> in livestock.

442

# 443 **3.3** Variability of the GHG balance at the level of the pastoral ecosystem

The balances between GHG emissions and C accumulation over WTSA highlighted contrasts between months (figure 8). In the cold dry season, the monthly balances varied between – 0.84 in November and – 0.32 tCO<sub>2</sub>-eq.ha<sup>-1</sup>.Month<sup>-1</sup> in February. In the hot dry season, the monthly budget varied between – 0.07 in March and – 0.02 Ggeq-CO<sub>2</sub>.month<sup>-1</sup> in June. In the wet season, the monthly budget varied between +0.11 in October and +1.03 tCO<sub>2</sub>-eq.ha<sup>-1</sup>.Month<sup>-1</sup> in September. At the WTSA scale, the C balance varied between seasons: kit was positive in the wet season (+0.58 tCO<sub>2</sub>-eq.ha<sup>-1</sup>.Month<sup>-1</sup>) and negative in the cool dry season (- 451 0.57 tCO<sub>2</sub>-eq.ha<sup>-1</sup>.Month<sup>-1</sup>) and in the hot dry season (-0.05 tCO<sub>2</sub>-eq.ha<sup>-1</sup>. Month<sup>-1</sup>). A
452 seasonal or monthly negative balance means that C emissions more than offset C
453 accumulation.

454 Overall, all the landscape units of the pastoral ecosystem emitted on average +2.601 teq-455  $CO_2.ha^{-1}.year^{-1}$ , and sequestered -2.78 teq- $CO_2.ha^{-1}.year^{-1}$ , on average. That is equivalent to an 456 annual GHG balance of -0.16 teq- $CO_2.ha^{-1}.year^{-1}$ . Thus the WTSA pastoral ecosystem 457 sequestrated -0.04 ±0.01 teq-C.ha<sup>-1</sup>.year<sup>-1</sup> the 2014-2015 year.

458

#### 459 **4. Discussion**

The aim of this study was to provide a dynamic C balance that accounts for the variability of GHG emissions and C accumulation over time. In this section, we discuss the main factors that explain this variability and underline key sources of uncertainty. The factors that explain the seasonal variations in the C balance for the 2014-2015 period help predict likely interannual variability of the C balance for Sahelian pastoral ecosystems.

465

466

#### 4.1 Rainfall is the main factor explaining seasonal variations in the C balance

Results showed marked seasonal variations in the C balance of the pastoral ecosystem 467 468 studied. The positive C balance during the wet season mainly resulted from the high rates of GHG emissions (mainly N<sub>2</sub>O from soil and CH<sub>4</sub> from ponds, see figure 5). C accumulation in 469 trees and shrubs during the wet season, the main period of photosynthesis, was not sufficient 470 471 to balance GHG emissions, and the return of plant mass to the soil was minimal during herbaceous growth and renewal of the leaves of woody plant resulting in a negative C 472 473 accumulation in the soil (see figure 6). The negative C balances throughout the dry season was mainly the result of a decrease in GHG emissions as the soil and the ponds dried up and 474 the progressive return to the soil of organic matter, mostly produced in the wet season, via the 475

burying of livestock excreta, herbaceous litter and the leaves of woody plant. Feces and litter mass were larger in the cold dry season, thereby increasing C accumulation in soil and rendering the balance more negative in the cold dry season than in the following hot dry season. These marked seasonal variations in the C balance were driven by (i) the seasonality of the monsoon climate, and (ii) pastoral practices characterized by seasonal herd mobility (also a consequence of the monsoon climate).

Under a Sahelian semi-arid monsoon climate, most photosynthesis and organic matter 482 decomposition occur in the wet season (de Souza Rezende et al., 2016). The wet season is 483 consequently the most critical period for the C balance, as indicated by the positive C balance 484 485 and highly variable GHG emissions (sections 2.3 and 2.1). During the dry season the feces deposited by livestock, the transfer of the standing straw to litter activated by livestock 486 trampling and woody plant leaves and twigs falling onto the soil all contribute to the litter that 487 488 is progressively fragmented and buried in the topsoil over the course of the dry season (Coleman et al., 1989). These inputs of organic matter into the top soil pave the way for the 489 490 peak biological activity and decomposition during the three to four months of the following 491 wet season. Rainfall fills the ponds, increases soil moisture and activates soil biological activity, causing a rapid increase in GHG emissions from the soil and even greater from the 492 surface water. Indeed, the high inputs of litter and fecal matter to the soil during the preceding 493 dry season, wetting by rain triggered biological activity in the soil, resulting in high N<sub>2</sub>O 494 emissions. Notable quantities of CH<sub>4</sub> were also emitted from the surface of ponds due to 495 anaerobic fermentation of organic materials in the water and in the pond sediments. The 496 497 organic materials originate from feces deposited by livestock either directly in the pond or around the edges while drinking and resting during the wet season (Assouma et al., 2017), but 498 499 also from the litter, including the leaves of woody plants that accumulated on the pond floor in the dry season or were transported by runoff from the vicinity of the pond. 500

Livestock were responsible for a major contribution to the seasonality of the C balance, due to 501 transhumance and its direct and indirect effects on GHG emissions and C accumulation in the 502 soil. In the wet season, transhumant herds moved back to the Ferlo rangeland to take 503 504 advantage of the high feed quality of the new growth triggered by the resumption of rainfall (Assouma et al., 2018). The livestock stocking rate in the WTSA peaked at 0.39TLU/ha in the 505 506 wet season, versus 0.35 and 0.33TLU/ha in the cold and hot dry season, respectively. The wet 507 season with its higher stocking rate is characterized by the large quantities of green fodder grazed and of excrement deposited on the ground with major concentrations around 508 settlements and ponds that are full of water at that time, explaining why CH<sub>4</sub> enteric 509 510 emissions and soil N<sub>2</sub>O emissions were higher in the wet season. Free grazing leads to *in situ* consumption of about 30% of herbaceous biomass production (Assouma, 2016) and to in situ 511 recycling of more than 50% of this ingested biomass via animal excretion (Diawara et al., 512 513 2018). This recycling, in association with dung beetles, accelerates the return of carbohydrates to the soil, thus contributing to C sequestration (Herrick and Lal, 1995; 514 515 Soussana et al., 2010). In addition, the effect of cattle trampling while grazing facilitates the 516 transfer of standing herbaceous mass (e.g. straw) to the litter, and its fragmentation and burying in the soil (Hiernaux et al., 2014). Dung and litter inputs via cattle trampling are two 517 518 C input flows activated by livestock that explain the positive C accumulation in soil during 519 the dry season.

520

#### 521

#### 4.2 Inter-annual variability of rainfall and its consequences for the C balance

In the Sahelian region, rainfall distribution drives the pastoral ecosystem's annual production (Hiernaux et al., 2009), which is also modulated by the pastoral populations' management practices (Sy, 2010). Soil moisture drives vegetation growth which is also limited by the availability of soil nutrients, especially N and P (Penning de Vries and Djiteye, 1982). Soil moisture also drives GHG emissions and hence the C balance (section 4.1.).

The present study was carried out in a year with low rainfall (204 mm.year<sup>-1</sup>) compared with 527 the long-term average in the area (327.9± 132.6 mm.year<sup>-1</sup> in Widou Thiengoly from 1956 to 528 2015). In addition, the long dry spell that occurred in July 2014, stopped herbaceous growth 529 which did not start again 41 days later with new germination, resulting in poor final yields. In 530 September 2015, the herbaceous yields measured in the WTSA reached 1978.9 kgDM.ha<sup>-1</sup> 531 (33% higher than in 2014) for 298.8 mm annual rainfall (45% higher than in 2014) with no 532 long interruption in rainfall distribution between July and October. In 2016, annual rainfall 533 totaled 398.2 mm (95% higher than in 2014), but the weighted mean herbaceous yield over 534 WSTA was only 1567.3 kgDM.ha<sup>-1</sup> because of the irregular distribution of the rainfall events 535 536 with two extremely large events cumulating 52% of annual rainfall in a single week in August. The marked inter-annual variations in herbage yield in WTSA between 2014 and 537 2016 confirmed that not only variable total annual rainfall but also rainfall distribution causes 538 539 interannual variability of the functioning and hence of the C balance of pastoral ecosystems. We can hypothesize that an increase in herbaceous production would increase the livestock 540 541 fodder intake-excretion loop by delaying the livestock departure for dry season transhumance and increase herd growth and hence C accumulation in livestock. The delay in the departure 542 for transhumance would increase enteric CH<sub>4</sub> emission and hence total GHG emissions in the 543 WTSA. We estimated that if no herds had left for transhumance in the dry season in our study 544 period and if livestock nutrition had remained unchanged, total enteric emission would have 545 increased by 55% and its contribution to the total GHG emissions would have increased by 546 16% (assuming that other GHG fluxes remained unchanged). All these processes would 547 548 converge and increase transfers of litter and animal excrement to the soil with uncertain consequences for C accumulation in soil. More organic matter input in the soil would not only 549 550 increase C inputs to the soil but also stimulate soil biological activity and hence GHG emissions from the soil and surface water. However, if the increase in grazing pressure due to 551

livestock mobility management is not sufficient to use up the additional herbaceous biomass, either litter decomposition will slow down or else the remaining standing herbaceous masses will increase the risk of bush fire during the dry season (Nielsen et al., 2003). Bush fire would increase GHG emissions and decrease inputs of organic matter input into the soil, which would drive C accumulation in the soil toward negative values as a proportion of the burned area.

558 Finally, this section shows that there are many different effects of rainfall patterns on the 559 ecosystem GHG fluxes and C stock variations, some of which are antagonist, with major 560 uncertainties in the final C balance.

- 561
- 562

563

# 4.3 Rain-based processes explain a large proportion of uncertainties in the C balance

Knowledge gaps about the response of this ecosystem to variable rainfall remain that may explain some of the uncertainties in the C balance calculated in this study. These uncertainties are due to: (i) extrapolation over time and interpolation of some GHG fluxes or stock variations based on one-off measurements, (ii) disregarding certain flows (e.g. leaching, run-off), (iii) under-consideration of interspecific variability that may be of importance in extreme years (very dry or very rainy years).

As regards extrapolation, most of the fluxes and stocks described in this study were estimated 570 571 from measurements that were one-off measurements made monthly, bi-monthly, or once a year, and extrapolated to the length of the study period, assuming stability over the period 572 (months, seasons or years). However, these measurements may be too far apart. Indeed, GHG 573 fluxes from the soil are highly sensitive to soil moisture. Soil moisture can vary very rapidly 574 575 during the wet season depending on the rainfall distribution pattern (Delon et al., 2015) and it is consequently risky to extrapolate a one-off measurement to a whole month. This 576 uncertainty could be reduced by using data from flux towers with continuous recording of 577

CO<sub>2</sub> fluxes as described in (Tagesson et al., 2015b) and using modeling approaches (i.e. 578 watering experiments to calculate a regression between soil GHG emissions and soil 579 moisture). Moreover, our estimation of the annual wood mass increment of trees was based on 580 581 interpolation from the stem circumference increment over a period of six years (section 2.4.2). This six-year period is long compared to the one-year period used for the assessment of C 582 accumulation in other ecosystem compartments (soil and livestock). Nevertheless, the six-583 year period may conceal the inter-annual variability of tree growth in relation with inter-584 annual rainfall variability (Takimoto et al., 2008). 585

Disregarding some processes whose impact was considered minor in a dry year, (which was the case in our study year), would need to be reconsidered when assessing some **C fluxes** and stock variations in more rainy years. For instance, the  $CO_2$  and  $CH_4$  emissions from the soil were the C output flows used for the assessment of C accumulation in the soil. C losses through leaching and runoff were disregarded, as both are low when rainfall is limited (Kindler et al., 2011), but could be non-negligible in a more rainy year. It would be worth checking these processes in a future study including more rainy years.

Moreover, in the present study, interspecific differences in C sequestration or enteric 593 emissions between woody plants and livestock were not taken fully into account. The annual 594 increment in tree diameter was obtained from measurements made on 24 individual trees 595 belonging to the four main species. Although they were the most representative species in the 596 area, a more exhaustive consideration of specific diversity should be envisaged in a future 597 study. It would be useful to include rainfall-driven processes, like the population dynamics of 598 woody plants (mortality, regeneration, inter-individual interactions) that were not taken into 599 account in the present study but that may have an impact on the variability of C stocks and 600 601 fluxes between years depending on rainfall. The lack of knowledge about the root mass of woody plants, its turnover and rhizodeposition flows also led to uncertain estimations in this 602

study, since they were all based on single, not species-specific, fixed rainfall-independent 603 604 coefficients (see sections 2.4.1). Similarly, the population dynamics of livestock depend on rainfall. Forage availability determines animal mortality and birthrates. Between year changes 605 606 in these parameters may call for reassessment of the long-term C accumulation in livestock. For instance, high mortality rates were observed in the Sahel during the severe droughts in the 607 1970s and 1980s. Large uncertainties on these zootechnical parameters persist due to the 608 difficulties encountered by the majority of Sahel countries to establish reliable national 609 statistical information systems (Lesnoff et al., 2012). Changes in these zootechnical 610 parameters in response to rainfall patterns is species-dependent. For instance, small ruminant 611 612 herds (goats in particular) are more resilient to drought events. Estimated enteric emissions were likewise based on measurements made only in ruminants (Assouma et al., 2018), while 613 614 default emission factors were used for non-ruminants (donkeys and horses, that account for 615 11% of the total livestock population in TLU). The proportion of ruminants in the livestock population of the WTSA varies depending on transhumance practices that also vary between 616 617 years, due to inter-annual rainfall variability. Indeed ruminants (cattle and sheep in particular) 618 move about more in transhumance (Sy, 2010) than non-ruminants. Donkeys and horses are kept in the WTSA as draft animals to transport water from the borehole (donkeys) or people 619 620 between camps and markets (horses).

The sensitivity of the C balance of this pastoral ecosystem to both changes in rainfall volume and distribution, and herd mobility and composition deserves further research and highlights the interest of establishing observatories to monitor pastoral systems over periods of a few consecutive years.

625

#### 626

# 5. Conclusions and future outlook

This study highlights the marked seasonal variability in the C balance of the Sahelian pastoral 627 628 ecosystem studied here. The wet season was characterized by positive C balances due to major emissions from the soil (N<sub>2</sub>O), surface water and animals (CH<sub>4</sub>). Conversely, in the dry 629 season C balances were negative because fluxes were dominated by C accumulation in soils. 630 631 Soil C inputs (animal excreta, burying of litter in the soil) mainly occurred at the beginning of the dry season, during the cold dry season, when animals had not yet left for transhumance. 632 These soil C inputs paved the way for the high GHG emissions measured during the wet 633 season. These marked seasonal variations in GHG emissions and C sequestration were 634 explained by biotic factors (e.g. the flushes of soil biological activity during the wet season), 635 and by livestock farmers' practices (e.g. seasonality of the presence of livestock, adaptation of 636 the animal stocking rate to available forage) all driven by rainfall patterns (e.g. the seasonality 637 of rainfall and soil moisture). 638

639 The seasonal variations in emissions and C sequestration resulted in a slightly negative full C balance over the annual cycle at -0.04±0.01 teq-C.ha<sup>-1</sup>.year<sup>-1</sup> for the 2014-2015 cycle. These 640 results support the hypothesis that tropical grassed ecosystems can act as a carbon sink, as 641 642 demonstrated in better documented ecosystems supporting extensive livestock systems under temperate climates (Soussana et al., 2004). The present study underlines the fact that woody 643 vegetation is a key C sink, more than soil, in Sahelian pastoral ecosystems. Indeed the soil 644 sequestration potential is lower in the Sahel than under temperate conditions because of faster 645 organic matter mineralization in sandy soils (Kalbitz et al., 2000), and in hot climates (Kotir, 646 647 2011). This lower potential is also explained by the fact that in sandy soils (with poor clay content), the organic C generated after the decomposition process cannot bind to clay 648 649 minerals (phyllosilicates), i.e. chemical protection, or be embedded in soil microaggregates, 650 i.e. physical protection (Six et al., 2002).

The negative C balance found in this study clashes with the traditional image of African 651 652 livestock having a major impact on climate change. The negative image was consolidated by sectorial and LCA studies (Gerber et al., 2013) that only took anthropogenic sources of GHG 653 654 into account. Our results differ from those of other studies because the new methodology tested in this study considers all the ecosystem components (animals, soil and plants) and the 655 656 interactions between themselves and with the atmosphere. This ecosystem angle revealed key points that need to be taken into account when allocating impacts between livestock and 657 658 natural processes to improve the accuracy of future LCAs of pastoral livestock products. For instance, a more detailed analysis of organic input flows (feces versus plant material) is 659 needed to allocate N<sub>2</sub>O and CH<sub>4</sub> emissions from the soil and water to livestock versus 660 vegetation. The ecosystem approach also revealed numerous indirect mitigation effects of 661 livestock on climate change. Pastoral systems maintain rangelands that have a sequestration 662 663 potential in soil and trees, and these systems also indirectly avoid GHG emissions by reducing the termite population and the risk of bush fires as the grazing herds ingest the herbaceous 664 mass and bury it in the soil as they move around (section 4.1). 665

666 The other benefits of this ecosystem approach are a better understanding of the drivers of the C balance that identifies appropriate and effective mitigation options with reference to the 667 seasonal and between year dynamics of the C balance (sections 4.1 and 4.2). For instance, 668 controlling organic matter inputs in natural ponds in the wet season and keeping water 669 flowing in the vicinity of the borehole in the dry season are key options to mitigate CH<sub>4</sub> 670 emissions from surface water. Harvesting surplus forage at the beginning of the dry season in 671 672 more rainy years will both reduce the risk of bush fires and increase livestock productivity. Indeed, storing forage will increase forage availability during the dry season, and hence 673 reduce transhumance with consequently less energy expenditure for animal movements for 674

the same level of enteric methane emissions. More details on mitigation options and theirpotential adoption are available in Assouma (2016).

More largely in terms of research agendas, these new results call for more ecosystem 677 approaches to the C balances in agricultural systems worldwide to fully account for both 678 direct and indirect, and both negative and positive, effects of agricultural activities on climate 679 680 change. If the mitigation effects of livestock activities are confirmed in other ecosystems, we 681 can imagine that these new elements will be incorporated in IPPC guidelines and recommendations, in the same way as C sequestration in pasture was included in the revised 682 guidelines (IPCC, 2006). Agricultural activities differ from other human activities as they 683 684 largely depend on natural resources and contribute to numerous ecosystem services. This is particularly true for low-input systems that largely dominate agricultural systems in tropical 685 regions. The first studies on sylvo-pastoral and agro-pastoral systems in West Africa suggest 686 687 that the share of rangelands in the landscape is a key parameter for C neutrality in these agricultural systems (Vayssières et al., 2017). Generalization of ecosystem C balances for 688 diverse ecosystems along agro-climatic gradients (from arid to sub-humid climate areas) will 689 690 facilitate the full integration of mobile livestock impacts in LCA studies. Integrating the many impacts livestock have on the diverse ecosystems they cross along their transhumance path is 691 a key methodological issue for LCA studies of pastoral livestock products. 692

Despite the low productivity of pastoral systems, they are already known for their contribution to food security and the socio-economic benefits they have for local population and national economies, in particular in the Sahel. The mitigation potential of pastoral ecosystems revealed by the present study is a complementary argument for the reinforcement of policies supporting pastoral systems. Such policies will need to reinforce the mobility of herds and people as a key to the sustainability of pastoral populations, the ecological equilibrium of rangelands and hence a neutral C balance of pastoral ecosystems. This mobility is threatened in many SSA countries by human population growth and the resulting urban andcrop expansion onto rangelands.

702 The results of this study provide arguments for including pastoral livestock systems in payment for environmental services programs. Despite the limited C sequestration potential of 703 704 arid ecosystems occupied by pastoral systems, they account for about 40% of African land 705 stretching over 6,000 km from the Atlantic Ocean to the Red Sea (Le Houerou, 1989). C markets may be an opportunity to pay pastoral populations for the environmental services 706 707 they provide, thereby increasing their livelihoods (Lipper et al., 2010). These ecosystems support limited human population densities which may increase the efficiency of the 708 709 mechanism (Dutilly-Diane et al., 2007).

710

#### 711 Acknowledgements

The Islamic Development Bank (the Merit Scholarship Program for High Technology) and
the European Union (the FP7-KBBE-2010 Animal Change project) provided significant
financial support.

### 715 **References**

- Archimède, H., Eugène, M., Marie Magdeleine, C., Boval, M., Martin, C., Morgavi, D.P.,
  Lecomte, P., Doreau, M., 2011. Comparison of methane production between C3 and C4
  grasses and legumes. Animal Feed Science and Technology 166–167, 59-64.
- Assouma, M.H., 2016. Approche écosystémique du bilan des gaz à effet de serre d'un territoire sylvo-pastoral sahélien : contribution de l'élevage, AgroParisTech. L'Institut des
  Sciences et Industries du Vivant et de l'Environnement, AGROPARISTECH, Montpellier, p. 230.
- Assouma, M.H., Lecomte, P., Hiernaux, P., Ickowicz, A., Corniaux, C., Decruyenaere, V.,
  Diarra, A.R., Vayssières, J., 2018. How to better account for livestock diversity and fodder
  seasonality in assessing the fodder intake of livestock grazing semi-arid sub-Saharan
  Africa rangelands. Livestock Science 216, 16-23.
- Assouma, M.H., Serça, D., Guérin, F., Blanfort, V., Lecomte, P., Touré, I., Ickowicz, A.,
  Manlay, R.J., Bernoux, M., Vayssières, J., 2017. Livestock induces strong spatial
  heterogeneity of soil CO2, N2O, CH4 emissions within a semi-arid sylvo-pastoral
  landscape in West Africa. Journal of Arid Land 9, 210 221.
- Chirat, G., Groot, J.C.J., Messad, S., Bocquier, F., Ickowicz, A., 2014. Instantaneous intake
  rate of free-grazing cattle as affected by herbage characteristics in heterogeneous tropical
  agro-pastoral landscapes. Applied Animal Behaviour Science 157, 48-60.
- Clark, P.J., Evans, F.C., 1954. Distance to Nearest Neighbor as a Measure of Spatial
  Relationships in Populations. Ecology 35, 445-453.
- Coleman, D.C., Oades, J.M., Uehara, G., 1989. Dynamics of soil organic matter in tropical
  ecosystems, p. 71.
- de Souza Rezende, R., S. Graça, M.A., dos Santos, A.M., Medeiros, A.O., Santos, P.F.,
  Nunes, Y.R., Gonçalves Júnior, J.F., 2016. Organic Matter Dynamics in a Tropical Gallery
  Forest in a Grassland Landscape. Biotropica 48, 301-310.
- 741 Delon, C., Mougin, E., Serça, D., Grippa, M., Hiernaux, P., Diawara, M., Galy-Lacaux, C.,
- Kergoat, L., 2015. Modelling the effect of soil moisture and organic matter degradation on
  biogenic NO emissions from soils in Sahel rangeland (Mali). Biogeosciences 12, 32533272.
- 745 Devineau, J.-L., Fournier, A., Nignan, S., 2010. Savanna fire regimes assessment with
  746 MODIS fire data: Their relationship to land cover and plant species distribution in western
- 747 Burkina Faso (West Africa). Journal of Arid Environments 74, 1092-1101.

- Diawara, M.O., Hiernaux, P., Mougin, E., Grippa, M., Delon, C., Diakité, H.S., 2018. Effets
  de la pâture sur la dynamique de la végétation herbacée au Sahel (Gourma, Mali): une
  approche par modélisation. Cahiers Agricultures 27, 15010.
- Doran-Browne, N.A., Ive, J., Graham, P., Eckard, R.J., 2016. Carbon-neutral wool farming in
  south-eastern Australia. Animal Production Science 56, 417-422.
- Dutilly-Diane, C., McCarthy, N., Turkelboom, F., Bruggeman, A., Tiedemann, J., Street, K.,
  Serra, G., 2007. Could payments for environmental services improve rangeland
- management in Central Asia, West Asia and North Africa? IFPRI, Washington, États-Unis.
- Gerber, P.J., Steinfeld, H., Henderson, B., Mottet, A., Opio, C., Dijkman, J., Falcucci, A.,
  Tempio, G., 2013. Tackling climate change through livestock A global assessment of
  emissions and mitigation opportunities, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United
- 759 Nations (FAO), Rome., p. 139.
- Gill, R.A., Jackson, R.B., 2000. Global patterns of root turnover for terrestrial ecosystems.
  New Phytologist 147, 13-31.
- Henry, M., Picard, N., Trotta, C., Manlay, R., Valentini, R., Bernoux, M., Saint-André, L.,
  2011. Estimating tree biomass of sub-Saharan African forests: a review of available
  allometric equations. Silva Fennica 45, 477-569.
- Herrero, M., Henderson, B., Havlik, P., Thornton, P.K., Conant, R.T., Smith, P., Wirsenius,
  S., Hristov, A.N., Gerber, P., Gill, M., Butterbach-Bahl, K., Valin, H., Garnett, T.,
  Stehfest, E., 2016. Greenhouse gas mitigation potentials in the livestock sector. Nature
  Clim. Change advance online publication.
- Herrick, J.E., Lal, R., 1995. Soil physical property changes during dung decomposition in a
  tropical pasture. Soil Science Society of America Journal 59, 908-912.
- Hiernaux, P., Ayantunde, A., Kalilou, A., Mougin, E., Gérard, B., Baup, F., Grippa, M.,
  Djaby, B., 2009. Trends in productivity of crops, fallow and rangelands in Southwest
  Niger: Impact of land use, management and variable rainfall. Journal of Hydrology 375,
  65-77.
- Hiernaux, P., Bielders, C.L., Valentin, C., Bationo, A., Fernandez-Rivera, S., 1999. Effects of
  livestock grazing on physical and chemical properties of sandy soils in Sahelian
  rangelands. Journal of Arid Environments 41, 15.
- Hiernaux, P., Diawara, M., Gangneron, F., 2014. Quelle accessibilité aux ressources
  pastorales du Sahel ? L'élevage face aux variations climatiques et aux évolutions des
  sociétés sahéliennes. Afrique contemporaine 249, 21-35.
- Hiernaux, P., Le Houerou, H.N., 2006. Les parcours du Sahel. Sécheresse 17, 51-71.

- Hiernaux, P., M.I., C., L., D., P.N., D.L., 1994. Fluctuations saisonnières de la feuillaison des 782 arbres et des buissons sahéliens. Conséquences pour la quantification des ressources 783 fourragères. Revue d'Elevage et de Medecine Veterinaire des Pays Tropicaux 17, 9. 784
- IPCC, 2006. 2006 IPCC Guidelines for National Greenhouse Gas Inventories: Prepared by the 785 Greenhouse Gas Inventories Programme, Repport IPCC. IPCC. 786 National SWITZERLAND, p. 307. 787
- IPCC, 2013. Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of Working 788 Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change 789 in: Stocker, T.F., D. Qin, G.-K. Plattner, M. Tignor, S.K. Allen, J. Boschung, A. Nauels,
- 790

791

Y. Xia, V. Bex and P.M. Midgley (Ed.), Cambridge University Press, Intergovernmental

- Panel on Climate Change ed. Cambridge, Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, 792 793 NY, USA, p. 1535.
- 794 Jamali, H., Livesley, S.J., Grover, S.P., Dawes, T.Z., Hutley, L.B., Cook, G.D., Arndt, S.K.,
- 2011. The Importance of Termites to the CH4 Balance of a Tropical Savanna Woodland of 795 796 Northern Australia. Ecosystems 14, 698-709.
- Jamali, H., Livesley, S.J., Hutley, L.B., Fest, B., Arndt, S.K., 2013. The relationships between 797 798 termite mound CH4/CO2 emissions and internal concentration ratios are species specific. 799 Biogeosciences 10, 2229-2240.
- 800 Jones, D.L., Nguyen, C., Finlay, R.D., 2009. Carbon flow in the rhizosphere: carbon trading at the soil-root interface. Plant and Soil 321, 5-33. 801
- Kalbitz, K., Solinger, S., Park, J.-H., Michalzik, B., Matzner, E., 2000. Controls on the 802 dynamics of dissolved organic matter in soils: A review. Soil Science 165, 277-304. 803
- Kindler, R., Siemens, J.A.N., Kaiser, K., Walmsley, D.C., Bernhofer, C., Buchmann, N., 804
- Cellier, P., Eugster, W., Gleixner, G., GrŨNwald, T., Heim, A., Ibrom, A., Jones, S.K., 805
- Jones, M., Klumpp, K., Kutsch, W., Larsen, K.S., Lehuger, S., Loubet, B., McKenzie, R., 806
- 807 Moors, E., Osborne, B., Pilegaard, K.I.M., Rebmann, C., Saunders, M., Schmidt, M.W.I.,
- Schrumpf, M., Seyfferth, J., Skiba, U.T.E., Soussana, J.-F., Sutton, M.A., Tefs, C., 808
- Vowinckel, B., Zeeman, M.J., Kaupenjohann, M., 2011. Dissolved carbon leaching from 809 810 soil is a crucial component of the net ecosystem carbon balance. Global Change Biology 17, 1167-1185. 811
- Kotir, J.H., 2011. Climate change and variability in Sub-Saharan Africa: a review of current 812 and future trends and impacts on agriculture and food security. Environ Dev Sustain 13, 813 587-605. 814

- Le Houerou, H.N., 1989. The grazing land ecosystems of the African Sahel. Springer-Verlag,
  Berlin ; New York.
- Lesnoff, M., Corniaux, C., Hiernaux, P., 2012. Sensitivity analysis of the recovery dynamics
  of a cattle population following drought in the Sahel region. Ecological Modelling 232, 2839.
- Lipper, L., Dutilly-Diane, C., McCarthy, N., 2010. Supplying Carbon Sequestration From
  West African Rangelands: Opportunities and Barriers. Rangeland Ecology & Management
  63, 155-166.
- Marion, P., Veronique, L., Edgar, T., Jeremy, C., MinSheng, K., Vun, K.C., Maria, P.,
  Robert, M.E., 2015. Deadwood biomass: an underestimated carbon stock in degraded
  tropical forests? Environmental Research Letters 10, 044019.
- McGahey, D., Davies, J., Hagelberg, N., Ouedraogo, R., 2014. Pastoralism and the Green
  Economy a natural nexus? IUCN and UNEP, Nairobi, p. 72.
- Nassef, M., Anderson, S., Hesse, C., 2009. Pastoralism and climate change. Enabling adaptive
  capacity. Humanitarian Policy Group. Overseas Development Institute. London. 35pp.
- Nielsen, T.T., Rasmussen, K., Mbow, C., Touré, A., 2003. The fire regime of Senegal and its
  determinants. Geografisk Tidsskrift-Danish Journal of Geography 103, 43-53.
- Njoya, A., Bouchel, D., Ngo Tama, A.C., Moussa, C., Martrenchar, A., Letenneur, L., 1997.
- 833 Systèmes d'élevage et productivité des bovins en milieu paysan, in: Seiny-Boukar Lamine,
- P.J.-F.F.G. (Ed.), Atelier d'échange agricultures des savanes du nord-Cameroun : vers un
  développement solidaire des savanes d'Afrique centrale. CIRAD, CMR, pp. 109-121.
- 836 Pelster, D.E., Gisore, B., Goopy, J., Korir, D., Koske, J.K., Rufino, M.C., Butterbach-Bahl,
- K., 2016. Methane and Nitrous Oxide Emissions from Cattle Excreta on an East AfricanGrassland. Journal of Environmental Quality, 9.
- Penning de Vries, F., Djiteye, M., 1982. The productivity of Sahelian rangeland: a study of
  soils, vegetation and the exploitation of this natural resource. Centre for Agricultural
  Publishing and Documentation, Wageningen, The Netherlands, p. 547.
- Petersen, S.O., Blanchard, M., Chadwick, D., Del Prado, A., Edouard, N., Mosquera, J.,
  Sommer, S.G., 2013. Manure management for greenhouse gas mitigation. Animal : an
  international journal of animal bioscience 7, 266-282.
- Pollard, J.H., 1971. On Distance Estimators of Density in Randomly Distributed Forests.
  Biometrics 27, 991-1002.
- Rakotovao, N.H., Razafimbelo, T.M., Rakotosamimanana, S., Randrianasolo, Z.,
  Randriamalala, J.R., Albrecht, A., 2017. Carbon footprint of smallholder farms in Central

- Madagascar: The integration of agroecological practices. Journal of Cleaner Production
  140, 1165-1175.
- Rosenstock, T., Rufino, M., Butterbach-Bahl, K., Wollenberg, E., 2013. Toward a protocol
  for quantifying the greenhouse gas balance and identifying mitigation options in
  smallholder farming systems. Environmental Research Letters 8, 021003.
- Six, J., Callewaert, P., Lenders, S., De Gryze, S., Morris, S., Gregorich, E., Paul, E., Paustian,
- K., 2002. Measuring and understanding carbon storage in afforested soils by physical
  fractionation. Soil science society of America journal 66, 1981-1987.
- Soussana, J.F., Loiscau, P., Vuichard, N., Ceschia, E., Balesdent, J., Chevallier, T., Arrouay,
  D., 2004. Carbon cycling and sequestration opportunities in temperate grasslands. Soil use
  and managment 20, 12.
- Soussana, J.F., Tallec, T., Blanfort, V., 2010. Mitigation the greenhouse gas balance of
  ruminant production systems through carbon sequestration in grasslands. Animal : an
  international journal of animal bioscience 4, 33.
- Sy, O., 2010. Aménagements Hydrauliques et Vulnérabilité de L'élevage Transhumant au
  Ferlo (Sénégal). Sustentabilidade em Debate 1, 47-60.
- Tagesson, T., Fensholt, R., Cropley, F., Guiro, I., Horion, S., Ehammer, A., Ardö, J., 2015a.
  Dynamics in carbon exchange fluxes for a grazed semi-arid savanna ecosystem in West
  Africa. Agriculture, Ecosystems & Environment 205, 15-24.
- 868 Tagesson, T., Fensholt, R., Guiro, I., Rasmussen, M.O., Huber, S., Mbow, C., Garcia, M.,
- 869 Horion, S., Sandholt, I., Holm-Rasmussen, B., Göttsche, F.M., Ridler, M.-E., Olén, N.,
- Lundegard Olsen, J., Ehammer, A., Madsen, M., Olesen, F.S., Ardö, J., 2015b. Ecosystem
  properties of semiarid savanna grassland in West Africa and its relationship with
  environmental variability. Global Change Biology 21, 250-264.
- Takimoto, A., Nair, V.D., Nair, P.K.R., 2008. Contribution of trees to soil carbon
  sequestration under agroforestry systems in the West African Sahel. Agroforest Syst 76,
  11-25.
- Traoré, S., Nygård, R., Guinko, S., Lepage, M., 2008. Impact of Macrotermes termitaria as a
  source of heterogeneity on tree diversity and structure in a Sudanian savannah under
  controlled grazing and annual prescribed fire (Burkina Faso). Forest Ecology and
  Management 255, 2337-2346.
- Turner, M.D., McPeak, J.G., Ayantunde, A., 2014. The Role of Livestock Mobility in the
  Livelihood Strategies of Rural Peoples in Semi-Arid West Africa. Human Ecology 42,
  231-247.

- 883 Valentini, R., Arneth, A., Bombelli, A., Castaldi, S., Cazzolla Gatti, R., Chevallier, F., Ciais,
- P., Grieco, E., Hartmann, J., Henry, M., Houghton, R.A., Jung, M., Kutsch, W.L., Malhi,
- 885 Y., Mayorga, E., Merbold, L., Murray-Tortarolo, G., Papale, D., Peylin, P., Poulter, B.,
- Raymond, P.A., Santini, M., Sitch, S., Vaglio Laurin, G., van der Werf, G.R., Williams,
- C.A., Scholes, R.J., 2014. A full greenhouse gases budget of Africa: synthesis,
  uncertainties, and vulnerabilities. Biogeosciences 11, 381-407.
- 889 Vayssières, J., Assouma, M.H., Lecomte, P., Hiernaux, P., Bourgoin, J., Jankowski, F.,
- 890 Corniaux, C., Vigne, M., Torquebiau, E., Ickowicz, A., 2017. Livestock at the heart of
- 891 'climate-smart'landscapes in West Africa, in: Caron, P., Valette, E., Wassenaar, T.,
- 892 Coppens, D.E.G., Vatché, P. (Eds.), Living territories to transform the world, Quae ed,
- 893 Versailles pp. 111-117.
- Whitmore, A., 2001. Impact of livestock on soil. Landbauforschung Volkenrode FAL
  Agricultural Research, Sonderheft 226, 39-41.
- 896 Woomer, P.L., Tieszen, L.L., Tappan, G., Touré, A., Sall, M., 2004. Land use change and
- terrestrial carbon stocks in Senegal. Journal of Arid Environments 59, 625-642.

898

**Table 1.** Schedule of observations per component of the ecosystem with the number of measurement sites per landscape unit at Widou Thiengoly

900 (W) and Dier Biran (D)

Variations in	July.	Aug.	Sept.	Oct.	Nov.	Dec.	Jan.	Feb.	Mar.	Apr.	May	June	
fluxes/Stock	14	14	14	14	14	14	15	15	15	15	15	15	Location of observations
Enteric fermentation	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	5 steers from 3 herds across all landscape units
GHG fluxes from soil and water	W	W	W	W			W				W		Graz(5), Set(2), Pon(2), Bor(2), Pla(1), Encl(1)
Bush fires	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	Graz(5), Set(2), Pon(2), Bor(2), Pla(2), Encl(2)
Fuel combustion	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	Bor(1)
C accumulation in livestock	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	5 steers and 40 herds across all landscape units
C accumulation in trees and shrubs (stocks)							W					D	Graz(5), Set(2), Pon(2), Bor(2), Pla(2), Encl(2)
Soil C accumulation (stocks)							W						Graz(5), Set(2), Pon(2), Bor(2), Pla(2), Encl(2)
Soil C accumulation (C inputs)	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	W	Graz(5), Set(2), Pon(2), Bor(2), Pla(2), Encl(2)
Soil C accumulation (C outputs)	W	W	W	W			W				W		Graz(5), Set(2), Pon(2), Bor(2), Pla(1), Encl(1)

W: Measurements made in the Widou Thiengoly service area, D: Measurements made in the village of Dier Biran Graz: Grazing lands, Set: Settlements, Pon: Ponds, Bor: Borehole, Pla: Forest plantations, Encl: Enclosures

901	Figure	cantions
201	riguit	captions

903	Figure. 1. The pink circle shows the location of the Widou Thiengoly service area (study
904	area). The red star shows the complementary study site Dier Biram in the Ferlo region.
905	
906	Figure 2. Conceptual model of the functioning of a Sahelian pastoral ecosystem in terms of
907	nitrogen and carbon stocks-fluxes (the thickness of the borders of the boxes for C stocks and
908	of the arrows of the GHG fluxes is proportional to their volume).
909	
910	Figure 3. Aboveground-belowground and belowground-atmosphere carbon fluxes affecting
911	the accumulation of carbon in the soil in a typical Sahelian pastoral ecosystem.
912	
913	Figure 4. Temporal variability of total GHG emissions at the pastoral ecosystem scale (all
914	GHG sources included)
915	
916	Figure 5. Total GHG emissions at pastoral ecosystem scale ranked according to the category
917	of emission (in CO <sub>2</sub> -eq).
918	
919	Figure 6. Temporal variability of C stock at pastoral ecosystem scale
920	
921	Figure 7. Annual C accumulation in the WTSA pastoral ecosystem per category of C stocks
922	
923	Figure 8. Monthly variations in the C balance at the WTSA ecosystem scale balancing GHG
924	emissions (from soil, water, livestock, termites and motor pump) and C accumulation (in
925	plants, soil and livestock).























```
CH<sub>4</sub> from soil (8%)
```







 $\mathrm{CO}_2$  from the motor pump (<1%)





Tree wood (48%)



